Working with Learners and Educational Portfolios

Randall Longenecker MD
with commentary by Jack Kopechek MD
Faculty Teaching Scholars Workshop
June 2012

You will be able to:

- Demonstrate an understanding of portfolios in medical education – their definition, use in the professional development and use in formative and summative evaluations of medical students and residents

You will be able to:

- Articulate some challenges in portfolio preparation, evaluation, and system deployment
- Provide effective feedback to students and residents in the preparation of portfolio exhibits and coach learners in their professional development

You will be able to:

- Engage with other faculty in compiling both formative and summative evaluations of portfolio work

Swamp Learning

Giving Credit

- Donald Schön 1983
- David Kolb 1984
- Johanna Shapiro and Yve Talbot 1991
- Ron Epstein - 1999
- STFM Theme Day group - Denver 2001
- STFM group on Portfolios – T Kulie, UW, 2006
Reflective Practice

“How professionals think (and learn) in action…”

[a way of knowing, an epistemology of practice]

Peer Note

Educational Progress Note

Learner

Date/Time

Faculty

Comments

Improvisation - in the moment invented a new way of conveying to a patient that US is not 100% accurate in predicting baby’s gender; printed gender symbol, then “90%” on patient’s copy of US!

ACGME Competencies

Practice-Based Learning; Reflective Practice

Signed

Reflective Practice (v10.2)

- Demonstrates critical reflection-in and on-action
- Protects time for reflection-on-action and engages in scholarly activity
- Exhibits awareness of self in relation to others and of their perspectives (other perspective-taking)

Reflective Practice

- Reframes problems and creates “useful” ones, putting knowledge into action
- Reflects-in-action, attending to surprise, to “the things that do not fit,” and improvising in the moment, in the clinical situation
- Keeps the whole in mind, even while focusing on the details
A Continuum

- Reflection-in-action
- Reflection-on-action

Competency Cycle

- Unconsciously incompetent
- Consciously incompetent
- Consciously competent
- Unconsciously competent

Portfolios?

Portfolios

- Fostering and measuring reflective practice
  - Setting a pattern – Critical reflection in action; On action; Document; Repeat
  - Promoting a culture of inquiry and improvement
  - Demonstrating this competency to ourselves & others

ACGME Definition

The portfolio is an interactive web-based professional development tool that residents can use throughout their residencies to record and organize their learning and to reflect and receive feedback on their skills as physicians, building evidence that allows them to chart their own progress over time.

Portfolios – Rural Program

https://www.e-value.net/home/member_login.cfm
Patients and families invariably give us more credit for our opinions that what they are worth. I was able to improvise in the moment and devise a better way to communicate our uncertainty. I am a playful and creative person, and often crazy ideas come to me in the course of my work.

In the past I have been reluctant to act on these impulses — seemed unprofessional and risky. Now I know that this is an important skill in practice, and it actually may be one of those things I learned in childhood that will make me a better doctor.

I was performing an ultrasound with Dr. Longenecker as faculty, and informing the patient of her baby’s sex, when I got the bright idea to not only state a probability for our estimate as we often do, but explicitly document it for the patient and family’s reference later.

I was able to improvise — seemed unprofessional and risky. Now I know that this is an important skill in practice, and it actually may be one of those things I learned in childhood that will make me a better doctor.

I was performing an ultrasound with Dr. Longenecker as faculty, and informing the patient of her baby’s sex, when I got the bright idea to not only state a probability for our estimate as we often do, but explicitly document it for the patient and family’s reference later.
Now What?

In the future I will try to notice when I come up with inventive things, write them down, and then deliberately implement them again.

Scoring Rubric

1. Documentation or reflection missing; evidence of self-awareness or creativity lacking

2. Documentation and reflection present; generally adequate documentation, but some weaknesses in relating the documentation to learning

Scoring Rubric - RP

3. Documentation and reflection present; demonstrated improvisation and creativity resulting in a novel solution or insight

4. Documentation and reflection present; evidence of performance in this area that is sophisticated, multi-faceted and demonstrates clear and persistent behavior change

Challenges & Lessons

- Learner & faculty resistance
- Faculty development
- Formative or summative evaluation?
- Technology – online platform, mobile devices
Resistance/Feedback

Typical Student Narrative Comments
- The portfolios still seem like busy work, like a teenage journal entry, and I don't think they're useful.
- The portfolios don't really help with self-reflection. I am always tempted to make something up so that I would have something to write about.
- Having deep personal thoughts and opinions graded feels like an invasion of privacy.
- I suppose the portfolios are good in theory, but we have so much other stuff going on as MS2s that I dreaded having to do them every month. Please get rid of them for next year's MS2s.

Typical Faculty Narrative Comments
- I feel the students were able to show sides of themselves on paper that they did not show in person. Without the portfolio, I would miss seeing that other side.
- Really well picked topics, an important experience.
- The portfolio assignments did not seem to add much to the experience, in general.
- The portfolios were a VERY valuable part of the ECE2 experience in my opinion. The assignments really brought forth a lot more information about each student than was apparent in the "public" small group sessions.

Learner resistance
- Exhibit preparation in a workshop, twice yearly.
- Peer review and feedback sessions.
- Faculty portfolios, with learner reviews.

Faculty Development
- Scoring together.
- Critically reviewing each others’ feedback.
- Faculty Jam.

Formative or Summative
- Frame it as life-long learning.
- Good enough – that required to pass; Excellence – that to which we aspire.
- Other ideas?
Summative Evaluation

- Exhibits are scored by consensus between two faculty members or, if not possible, then among the entire faculty.
- Effective June 30, 2007, a minimum total score of 10 is required to be promoted from one post-graduate year to the next.

Summative Evaluation

- Effective June 30, 2009, one minimum score of at least 3 in each competency and a total score of 30 are required for graduation.
- Additional points (1 each) may be accrued by completing a "Peer Note" on your PDA or a "Praise Note" in E*Value™, documenting competency in a peer.

Additional Resources

- Family Medicine Digital Resource Library www.fmdrl.org - Search for “portfolio”
(Accessed 6-15-2012 and found 47 entries)
- For additional information, contact Dr. Longenecker at rlongenecker@embarqmail.com

"The hardest conviction to get into the mind of a beginner is that the education upon which he is engaged is not a college course, not a medical course, but a life course, for which the work of a few years under teachers is but a preparation."
- William Osler